

La Jolla Shores Permit Review Committee Minutes
4:00 p.m. Tuesday, Sept. 22, 2015
La Jolla Recreation Center, 615 Prospect Street, La Jolla, CA

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY OF MOTIONS MADE

7a. Fan Residence, 8295 Prestwick Drive.

Motion by Emerson, second by Lucas, that findings cannot be made because the proposed residence is not in compliance with PDO in that it does not conform to the character of the neighborhood. The motion passes 4-2-1 (Gordon abstains because not comfortable with saying yes or no.)

7d. Evans Residence, 8039 La Jolla Shores Drive SDP

Motion by Ducharme-Conboy, second by Gordon, that findings can be made for SDP, and for a CDP should that prove to be necessary, for a 1,389 sq ft addition and remodel of a 1,932 sq ft existing single family residence at 8039 La Jolla Shores Dr. The 0.183 acre site is in the SF zone of the La Jolla Shores Planned District, Coastal (Non-appealable) overlay zone within the La Jolla Community Plan Area. Council District 1.

The motion passes 7-0-0

7e. Davis Residence, 8430 La Jolla Shores Drive. SDP

Motion by Gordon, second by Donovan, that findings can be made for an SDP to construct a 1,118 square-foot addition and associated remodel to an existing single family dwelling unit located at 8430 LJ Shores Drive, with a second-story north side setback of four feet, as noted on the plans before the Committee and dated 9-22-2015. The 0.13-acre site is located within the Coastal Overlay Zone (Non-Appealable) at 8430 La Jolla Shores Drive in the LJSPD – SF zone(s) of the La Jolla Shores Planned District within the La Jolla Community Plan area and Council District 1.

The motion passes 6-0-1. Emerson abstains due to her personal relationship with the owners.

MINUTES OF PRC MEETING OF 9-22-2015

1. Welcome and Call to Order

4:03pm

2. Adoption of the Agenda

7-0-0

3. Non-Agenda Public Comment – 2 minutes each for items not on the agenda.

No public comment.

4. Non-Agenda Committee Member Comments

Laura Ducharme-Conboy: concerned about alleged 30-foot wall at 8440 Whale Watch Way. Tony Crisafi recused himself and left the room. Laura would like the project to be placed on the PRC agenda for its 10/27 meeting. She will contact the project manager, Joe Stanco, to find out more about the wall and report her findings to the Sec'y of the LJCPA, Helen Boyden.

Donovan added that several neighbors have contacted her about the wall to get information.

Donovan: Chair Crisafi will assist with review of draft meeting notes. Processing and forwarding to LJCPA.

Lucas: There are no postings on the Marouf project on Hidden Valley Road or on the Mofid

project on Glenwick Lane. No one here for Glenwick. Jim Fleming here for Marouf - will call owner and see if he can take a photo of the notice if indeed one is posted.

5. Chair Comments

None

6. Discussion to move Recurring Meeting Date -- Action Item

Donovan says can get them done in time for CPA if PRC Chair assists. The Committee agreed that she will send out to the Committee any specific questions she may have, but not the full minutes. The minutes will be submitted to the CPA as a draft, and then formally approved by the PRC at its next meeting.

7. Project Review

a. Fan Residence, 8295 Prestwick Drive

Tony Crisafi recuses himself but remains in the room to do the presentation, then leaves when Committee discussion begins.

- Project #: 425611
- Type of Structure: Single Family Residence
- Location: 8295 Prestwick Drive
- Applicant's Rep: Cori Del Castillo 858-459-9291 ccastillo@islandarch.com
- Project Manager: Morris Dye 619-446-5201 MDye@sandiego.gov
- Project Description: LA JOLLA (Process 3) Coastal Development Permit and Site Development Permit to demolish an existing residence and construct a new 5,757 sq ft 2-story residence over 1,381 sq ft basement at 8295 Prestwick Dr. The 0.132 acre site is in the Single Family (SF) zone of the La Jolla Shores Planned District, Coastal (Non-appealable) overlay zone within the La Jolla Community Plan Area. Council District 1.

Presentation by architect Tony Crisafi, assisted by Cory del Castillo.

Committee comments and questions:

Questions from committee members elicited the following information:

- From the street the full height of the two-story house is 29 feet to top of chimney, 27 feet for bulk of house. The west (front) elevation is softened and broken up by trees with canopies. The house immediately to the north is single story; the house immediately to the south has a 2nd story addition over the garage.
- Island Architects moved the house two feet to the south to give the neighbor to the north a larger side set-back of 8 feet at front corner of north side, then in the middle 11 feet, then at the rear corner, 8 ft. again. Side set-back on the south is at 5 feet except at corners which are at 9 ft and 12 ft.
- The articulation of the north wall was done in response to the Committee's feeling that the north wall was objectionable because it was flat and 27 feet high.
- The FAR is 0.27 because this is a very deep lot going all the way back to the canyon.

Public Comment:

- Patricia Miller: who lives three houses down: 1. The average side-backs in the neighborhood are not 5 feet; they are much larger. In fact, we measured the side setbacks and there are none that are 5 feet.
- Height: I thought one measured from existing grade - you are measuring from the pre-existing

pad. Crisafi- that's right re pad. As to side set-backs, we did a fly-over survey and also got from the City a stamped survey and some of the set-backs are at 5 feet.

[Crisafi leaves the room for committee discussion.]

Committee discussion:

- PDO says no flat roofs.
- The house has a very large boxy design which fills almost the entire front footage of the lot and goes up 27 feet all the way across. The width and the height sitting on top of a bermed up area makes the house loom over its neighbors.
- Were it not for the deepness of the lot going all the way back to the canyon, this would qualify as a mega-mansion.

Motion by Emerson, second by Lucas, that findings cannot be made because house is not in compliance with PDO in that it does not conform to the character of the neighborhood. 2nd by Lucas. The motion passes 4-2-1 (Gordon abstains because not comfortable with saying yes or no.)

b. Mofid Residence, 8656 Glenwick Lane - Substantial Conformance Review (SCR) Process 2

- Project #: 424462
- Type of Structure: Single Family Residence
- Location: 8656 Glenwick Lane
- Applicant: Jim Ferrin 760-580-0569 jamesferrin@gmail.com
- Project Manager: Firouzeh Tirandazi 619-446-5325 FTirandazi@sanidiego.gov
- Project Description: LA JOLLA (Process 2) SCR to CDP 154134 and SDP 162186 for a 768 square-foot addition to an existing single-family residence, and construction of a new 792 square-foot cabana, 175 square-foot master porch, and 175 square-foot office deck on a property located at 8656 Glenwick Lane. The 0.34 acre site is located within the SF (Single Family) Zone of the LJSPD, Coastal (Non-Appealable) Overlay, and Coastal Height Limit Limitation Overlay zones within the La Jolla CPA, and CD1.

Presenter: Jim Ferrin, designer.

Here to gather input from the Committee. This is essentially a room addition, but is a 2nd-story room addition. 637 SF is the added size of the project for GFA purpose. The cabana addition has been eliminated. The 637 SF size does not include the office deck, which has a patio below it.

Committee questions and comments:

- Committee questions elicited the following information:
- The new ridge line for the addition will be the height of the existing chimney. The new chimney will be 6 feet higher than it is now.
- Houses in the immediate vicinity are one-story. Further away there are two-story houses.

Committee will want to know, on applicant's returns,

- The views of the neighbors on the 2nd story addition.
- Drawings that clearly show the pre-existing grade.
- Applicant to provide Exhibit A drawings so that committee can properly review SCR application

Public Discussion:

Sousann Ayari: I live right across the street from the house. The house blocked views when it was built and will do so even more when it has a second-story addition. The size is such that other neighbors

are prevented from adding on to obtain views. CC&Rs say neighbors have to agree to a second story. Our Architectural Committee is functioning.

The Committee took no vote because notice of project had not been posted.

c. Marouf CDP for companion unit and garage

- Project #: 409685
- Type of Structure: Single Family Residence
- Location: 2465 Hidden Valley Road
- Applicant: James Fleming 619-743-5770 sflemingaia@aol.com
- Project Manager: Firouzeh Tirandazi 619-446-5325 FTirandazi@sandiego.gov
- **Project Description:** LA JOLLA (Process 3) Coastal Development Permit to construct a 2,193 sq ft companion unit and garage addition to an existing residence located at 2465 Hidden Valley Rd. The 12,650 sq ft site is located in the LJSPD-SF zone of the La Jolla Shores Planned District in the La Jolla Community Plan Area and Coastal Overlay Zone (Non-Appealable) in Council District 1.

Presenter: Jim Fleming, architect

Shows photo of posting of notice at time project began

Committee questions and comments:

Committee questions elicited the following information:

- Existing house is 2549 SF; addition is 2,193 SF.
- Home of neighbor to the north is about 30 feet from the property line.
- Mrs. Marouf is present and says she has spoken with 5 or 6 neighbors on Hidden Valley Road, including Jenny Feinberg who sits on the LJSA, and thinks they will be o.k. with the project. She says the present garage is unsightly and she is sure the neighbors will be happy to see it go.
- The companion unit has a kitchenette but is not intended as a rental. It is for grandparents, two sets of which already live in the area, or for their son should he decide to live here. .
- Parking for 5 cars.
- The safety of driving out onto Hidden Valley Road will be improved by pushing the garage back from the street as the Maroufs have done.
- Length of curb cut should be 18 feet, not 12. Existing garage walls and driveway will remain.

[N.B. Bob Steck left at 5:27.]

Public Comment:

None

Committee Discussion:

- Height of companion unit - height limit is 15 feet if on ground, but since is on garage, can go higher. This is very high.
- They could turn the gable and articulate the roof of the companion unit, thus diminishing height and mitigating massing.

On applicant's return, the Committee will need:

- A precise statement of SF of companion unit vs. garage.
- Evidence of notice to the neighbors.

Motion by Lucas to continue the matter to the next Committee meeting. Emerson seconds. Motion passes 7-0-0

d. Evans Residence, 8039 La Jolla Shores Drive SDP

- Project #: 428297
- Type of Structure: Single Family Residence
- Location: 8039 La Jolla Shores Dr.
- Applicant: Robert Davidson 858-456-8555 robert@isarchitecture.com
- Project Manager: Morris Dye 619-446-5201 MDye@sandiego.gov
- **Project Description:** LA JOLLA (Process 3) Site Development Permit and Coastal Development Permit for a 1,389 sq ft addition and remodel of a 1,932 sq ft existing single family residence at 8039 La Jolla Shores Dr. The 0.183 acre site is in the SF zone of the La Jolla Shores Planned District, Coastal (Non-appealable) overlay zone within the La Jolla Community Plan Area. Council District 1.

Presenter: Robert Davidson, architect.

Committee comments and questions:

The Committee's questions elicited the following information:

- Site 0.13 acre. Almost doubling size of residence. Habitable SF 3321 and additional for garage 400 SF, for total GFA of 3721. Existing SF 1932, addition 1389, 400 garage. Existing GFA 2332, will increase to 3721.
- Side setbacks 5 feet on north and 8'7", going to 5, on south. Rear setback will increase from 4 to 8 feet.
- Greenscape 0.35.
- Parking adequate.
- Owner speaks: Neighbor to south is thrilled and happy to have someone in house again. Neighbor to north have talked to on phone briefly; their guesthouse on the corner has no windows looking our way. I will be talking to them about replacing the wall at my cost.

Public Discussion:

None

Committee Discussion:

Motion Ducharme-Conboy, second by Gordon: Findings can be made for SDP and CDP should that prove necessary. The motion passes 7-0-0

e. Davis Residence, 8430 La Jolla Shores Drive. SDP

- Project #: 435040
- Type of Structure: Single Family Residence
- Location: 8430 La Jolla Shores Drive
- Applicant: Robert Davidson 858-456-8555 robert@isarchitecture.com
- Project Manager: Morris Dye 619-446-5201 MDye@sandiego.gov
- **Project Description:** LA JOLLA (Process 3) Site Development Permit to construct a 1,118 square-foot addition and associated remodel to an existing single family dwelling unit. The 0.13-acre site is located within the Coastal Overlay Zone (Non-Appealable) at

8430 La Jolla Shores Drive in the LJSPD – SF zone(s) of the La Jolla Shores Planned District within the La Jolla Community Plan area and Council District 1.

Presenter: Robert Davidson, architect.

Emerson discloses that these are her neighbors across the street and she has discussed the project extensively with them.

Committee comments and questions:

Committee questions elicited the following information:

- FAR 0.46; lot coverage .31. Lot size 5497 SF. Existing house 994, addition 1118, existing garage 356, add 59 SF for new garage. 21 neighbors contacted, 8 wrote letters, 9 wrote emails or made verbal comments.
- French drain is being added in front of the garage.

Committee discussion:

- The 1.9 foot north side setback is unnecessarily small. A metal flue could be used instead of a masonry flue, thus pulling the north wall of the house further back from the property line and increasing the side set-back. Presenter says BR now 12X12 and does not want to make it smaller.
- Safety issue if there were a fire next door. Neighboring property has a window in its south side wall and the window is not fire-rated, nor is the neighbor's wall. Presenter: our wall is fire-rated, as required by the code. Code permits 1.9 side setback.
- Side set-back of 1.9 is debatably non-conforming in neighborhood.

Motion by Donovan to continue on basis of the design as presented, second by Walkush: Motion passes 4-1-2 with Crisafi and Emerson abstaining. Emerson abstains because of personal relationship with owners of project.

Presenter offers to pull the north side set-back back four feet and makes a note to that effect on the plans and dates it 9-22- 2015.

Crisafi - I will entertain another motion.

Motion by Gordon, second by Donovan, that findings can be made for an SDP to construct a 1,118 square-foot addition and associated remodel to an existing single family dwelling unit located at 8430 LJ Shores Drive, with a second-story north side setback of four feet, as noted on the plans and dated 9-22-2015. The 0.13-acre site is located within the Coastal Overlay Zone (Non-Appealable) at 8430 La Jolla Shores Drive in the LJSPD – SF zone(s) of the La Jolla Shores Planned District within the La Jolla Community Plan area and Council District 1.

The motion passes 6-0-1. Emerson abstains due to her personal relationship with the owners.

The Committee adjourned at 7:10 p.m.

Minutes respectfully submitted by Dolores A. Donovan.